

# 2020-05-thru-10 GSWG Meeting Notes (May thru October)

## List of previous meetings, notes and recordings.

- [NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 29 October 2020](#)
- [NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 15 October 2020](#)
- [APAC Meeting - Wednesday 07 October 2020](#)
- [NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 01 October 2020](#)
- [APAC Meeting - Wednesday 23 September 2020](#)
- [NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 17 September 2020](#)
- [APAC Meeting - Wednesday 9 September 2020](#)
- [NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 3 September 2020](#)
- [APAC Meeting - Wednesday 26 August 2020](#)
- [NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 20 August 2020](#)
- [APAC Meeting - Wednesday 12 August 2020](#)
- [NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 6 August 2020](#)
- [APAC Meeting - Wednesday 29 July 2020](#)
- [Thursday 23 July 2020](#)
- [Thursday 09 July 2020](#)
- [Thursday 25 June 2020](#)
- [Thursday 11 June 2020](#)
- [Thursday 28 May 2020](#)

## NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 29 October 2020

### Meeting [recording](#)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Housekeeping announcement
  - a. Please keep microphone on mute if you are not speaking
  - b. This meeting will be recorded - start recording before the next item
2. Welcome notes; Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy and requirement to be a member of this WG by signing the charter to be read out or shown (2 mins)
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to
    - i. **discuss progress on activities of the active TFs**
    - ii. **introduce the dashboard project underway at the Ops team**
3. Introduction of new members - please introduce yourself on the call or by using the chat function in the format Name; Affiliation; Location; any other detail you would like to share
  - a. (no new members at this instance of the WG meeting)
4. **Announcement:** Changes in the upcoming schedule of the meeting of this WG. *Please note what with DST in vogue, the actual timings for non US based participants will change.*
  - a. Next Meeting Date : 12-Nov-2020 (in view of holidays in November etc)
  - b. Subsequent Schedule : Every 4 weeks (once a month on a specific day of the month) ; fix the meeting schedule by collaborating with [Dav id Luchuk](#)
5. **Announcement:** The Ops Team will be switching us to the same standard "one Meeting notes page per meeting" format as the other WGs are using [Steven Milstein](#)
  - a. A template to make it easier to set expectations for folks who are attending multiple WG and TF meetings. Also includes "Tasks" and "Action Items" etc
  - b. Scott Perry - deciding on a meeting to start with to implement this from the next instance of a WG meeting
  - c. Kalyan - "This one page per meeting allows to jot down details in an elaborative manner. I like this way of detailing."
6. Introduction to the new dashboard project from the Ops team
  - a. Based on 'Kanban' concept, will have WG and TF names and list of ToDo with state and status of tasks; drag-n-drop based UX
  - b. No requirement of PRs etc
  - c. Ops team reps are available to help WGs/TFs bootstrap into this new dashboard implementation.
    - i. [Karl](#) - how to mitigate against this becoming yet-another-repository of artefacts leading to more dissonance
    - ii. [Steven](#) - the approach is light-weight and replaces the individual sets of ToDo lists and possibly harmonization
    - iii. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - work across the Foundation is yet to adopt "agile"; the approach here is a first step towards that outcome; Ops is helping WGs/TFs to work more efficiently. The meeting schedule change indicates that the WG is looking at adopting "scrum of scrums" way of working with updates, dashboards and focus on deliverables.
    - iv. [Paul Knowles](#) from the perspective of the WG he has been involved in the evolution has been towards updates for TFs and FGs within.
7. Updates from the activities of the TFs
  - a. Governance Architecture TF
    - i. Primary focus to date has been the [ToIP governance metamodel](#)
    - ii. Need to get GitHub repo set up (with Ops team support) to commit the Pre-Draft document
    - iii. Need to select an editing tool for the ToIP Governance Architecture spec
    - iv. Proposed next meeting date: Tuesday Nov 10th, 10:00-11:00 PT / 17:00-18:00 UTC (*please ask for meeting invite on the Slack channel for the TF*)
  - b. Process & Roles TF
    - i. Set of documents approved in Pre-Draft deliverable status; please check the list under the wiki page for this TF
    - ii. Reviews requested of these documents from TF members as well as those who are interested in contributing; also assess the readiness and maturity of the documents to be presented to the WG

- iii. Proposed next meeting date : Wednesday Nov 4th, 11:30-12:30PST (*please join the Slack channel for the TF for comments, conversations and participation*)
- 8. Sharing of notes from the Special Meeting with Naomi Szekeres, Network of Networks Director at T3 Networks
- 9. Sharing of notes from any IIW31 session
  - a. Karl Kneis - ToIP and Digital Trust Ecosystems (multiple ToIP attendees) ([Video with Table of Contents](#))
  - b. Drummond Reed, [Principles of SSI](#)
  - c. Drummond Reed, ToIP Interoperability Profiles (TIPs)
  - d. (insert your name ; session title ; session convener)
- 10. [Karen Hand](#) EFWG Whitepaper initiative and collaboration across WGs

## NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 15 October 2020

Meeting [recording](#)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Housekeeping announcement
  - a. Please keep microphone on mute if you are not speaking
  - b. This meeting will be recorded - start recording before the next item
2. Welcome notes; Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy and requirement to be a member of this WG by signing the charter to be read out or shown (2 mins)
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to
    - i. **(a) review/approve a proposed Draft Deliverable,**
    - ii. **(b) review progress of active task forces**
3. Introduction of new members - please introduce yourself on the call or by using the chat function in the format Name; Affiliation; Location; any other detail you would like to share (5 mins)
4. **Announcement:** Special Meeting with Naomi Szekeres, Network of Networks Director at T3 Networks, to understand their specific ecosystem governance requirements—Friday Oct 16—8:30-9PM PT / 11:30-Noon ET / 15:30-16:00 UTC
  - a. Meeting invite and reminders to be sent separately; the meeting will be recorded; if you'd like to join the meeting please reach out to [David Luchuk](#)
5. Status update from APAC call ([Kalyan Kulkarni](#) 5 mins); also [see here](#)
6. Proposed Draft Deliverable: [Presentation Slides](#) [Risks of Verifiable Credentials](#) ([Scott Perry](#) 15 mins)
  - a. WG is approving this product as a draft deliverable (in Stage 2) to be reviewed/approved by the WG as an approved deliverable for the SC review/approval
7. Review/Discussion of proposed [ToIP Governance Metamodel](#) as a component of the ToIP Governance Architecture TSS Draft Deliverable ([Drummond Reed](#) 15 mins)
  - a. Structure
  - b. Normative statements
  - c. Dependency on the ToIP Governance Glossary
  - d. Next steps
8. MVF (Minimal Viable Framework) Strategy Proposal ([Drummond Reed](#) 10 mins)
  - a. (more details to come on this as soon as Drummond can write them up)
9. Any other business
  - a. Topics introduced by [sankarshan](#)
    - i. Discuss and review the current meeting schedule in light of whether it provides reasonable time to focus on work/tasks and make progress
    - ii. Discuss and consider the improvement towards meeting management and participation by being able to create agenda for n+2 meetings in advance

## APAC Meeting - Wednesday 07 October 2020

Meeting [recording](#)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Housekeeping announcement
  - a. Please keep microphone on mute if you are not speaking
  - b. This meeting will be recorded - start recording before the next item
2. Welcome notes; Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy to be read out or shown (2 mins)
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is **(a) to seek progress around on-going tasks (b) introduce any new activity planned (c) working topics specific to this WG**
3. Introduction of new members - please introduce yourself on the call or by using the chat function in the format Name; Affiliation; Location; any other detail you would like to share (5 mins)
  - a. [Eric Welton](#)(Korsimoro) - not really a new member, but I've returned from several months off-grid and am getting caught up with what's been happening.
4. Status Update from NA/EU call (15 mins)
  - a. Review on - Governance Architecture TSS ([Drummond Reed](#)). "Accepted to be a Draft" is available for review [here](#)."
    - i. [Eric Drury](#) - This is comprehensive and helps understand the details about meta models we are looking at under the GSWG
  - b. Review on - ([Scott Perry](#)) "Pre-Draft" is available for - [Process](#) and [Roles](#) Recommendations | [Credentials](#) [Class](#) Definitions | [Master Credential Policy Template](#)
5. Present/Walk through of Outline on Governance Framework Templates ([Eric Drury](#) ) 15 mins - Outline document is available [here](#)
  - a. [Eric Drury](#) -
    - i. The thought was to make an attempt to define some sort of a model for templates under the GSWG
    - ii. Do we have the governance of the governance stack, of the technology stack, so on and so forth - that was the triggering point
6. Clarifying discussion on above #5 (10 mins)
  - a. [Drummond Reed](#) - This is interesting - gives different perspective on the deliverables. Another way of envisaging the templates and meta models.

- b. The two stacks under ToIP explained by Drummond - Meta Model of ToIP Stack - Tech stack defines technical interoperability from top to bottom - similar to the one under governance stack
- c. Eric Drury - I thought of looking at governance model at each layer specifically
- d. Drummond - One of the key component is principles - idea is "Principles guide policies"
- e. Eric Drury - We need to provide some context on what is happening under the governance frameworks. What will be the highest level of inheritance?
- f. [Eric Welton](#) - Inheritance does not necessarily mean we have to have a pyramid.
- g. Eric Drury - How is the way forward for us to continue contributing for the meta model.
- h. Drummond - We may be can form a focused group which can start working on the meta models.
- i. [Scott Perry](#) - Work being done by Eric needs a home and I think Governance Architecture TF is a place.
- 7. Action - It was acknowledged that we need to have a **Meta Models TF** (more like a focused group) formed which will take this thought to next level to derive meta models for the GF layers -
  - a. Following members volunteered to contribute to this TF - i) [Drummond Reed](#) ii) [Eric Drury](#) iii) [Kalyan Kulkarni](#) iv) [John Phillips](#)
- 8. Any Other Business

Attendees:

- @Apichet Bhusry
- @Catherine Nabbala
- [Drummond Reed](#)
- [Eric Drury](#)
- [Eric Welton](#)
- [John Phillips](#)
- [Kalyan Kulkarni](#)
- [sankarshan](#)
- [Steven Milstein](#)
- [Victor Golubkov](#)

## NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 01 October 2020

Meeting recording link to be added here.

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Housekeeping announcement
  - a. Please keep microphone on mute if you are not speaking
  - b. This meeting will be recorded - start recording before the next item
2. Welcome notes; Linux Foundation antitrust policy to be read out or shown on screen (2 mins)
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is **(a) to recap on progress around on-going tasks (b) introduce any new activity planned (c) working topics specific to this WG**
3. Introduction of new members - please introduce yourself on the call or by using the chat function in the format Name; Affiliation; Location; any other detail you would like to share (5 mins)
4. Status Update (to be populated before the meeting for display/reading) in the format Activity Name; Activity Owner; Current Work; Next Milestone (5 mins)
  - a. Pre-Draft Deliverables (WIP)
    - i. Governance Architecture TSS ([Drummond Reed](#)). "Pre-Draft" is available for review [here](#)."
      1. Accepted to be a Draft Deliverable (by consensus)
    - ii. Process and Roles Recommendations ([Scott Perry](#)) "Pre-Draft is available for review [here](#) and [here](#)"
    - iii. Credentials Class Definitions ([Scott Perry](#)) "Pre-Draft" is available for review [here](#)."
    - iv. Master Credential Policy Template ([Scott Perry](#)) "Pre-Draft" is available for review [here](#)."
    - v. Any clarifying discussions on agenda item above (10 mins)
5. Introduction of planned and upcoming new activity in the format Activity Name; Activity Owner; Planned end state (5 mins)
  - a. Lorem Ipsum
6. Any clarifying discussions on agenda item above (5 mins)
7. Business of this WG (25 mins)
  - a. Receiving and working on inputs from other WGs where GSWG input, consultation and engagement is desired
  - b. Planning for communication requirements/inputs to the Communications Committee for topics to reach out to wider audience
  - c. Lorem Ipsum
8. Any Other Business
  - a. GSWG representative for the Operations work - [Steven Milstein](#)
  - b. Interest in a special meeting with Naomi Szekeres, T3 Innovation Network of Networks lead, to provide input on her questions about governance of the T3 Network.
  - c. Add any links to resources/news/updates relevant to this WG

Attendees:

- [Carly Huitema](#)
- [Chris Buchanan](#)
- [Chris Ingrao](#)
- [Darrell O'Donnell](#)
- [Jim St.Clair](#)
- [Kalyan Kulkarni](#)
- [Karl Kneis](#)
- [Paul Knowles](#)
- [Robin Alexander](#)
- [sankarshan](#)

- [Steve Magennis](#)
- [Steven Milstein](#)
- [Stu Vaeth](#)
- [Tom Plagge](#)
- [Tom Smedinghoff](#)
- [Trevor Butterworth](#)
- [David Luchuk](#)
- [Wenjing Chu](#)

## APAC Meeting - Wednesday 23 September 2020

**Note: New Meeting Bridge** - <https://zoom.us/j/97481438286> - All future APAC GSWG call will take place on the new Zoom meeting

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

### Recording

Presentation link is [here](#)

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to enable the participants to *meet and discuss **GSWG roadmap on deliverables, APAC call next set of activities***
2. Introduction of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share)
3. Activities since our last APAC call
  - a. All Members meeting - [slides](#)
  - b. GSWG NA/EU call
4. Presentation Topics
  - a. Recap on Roadmap of GSWG Deliverables (Drummond)
  - b. Recap on Class Definitions of VCs and Credential Policy Template (Scott)
5. Open Discussion
  - a. APAC call - What we want to take up next
  - b. Outreach and engagement from ToIP members

## NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 17 September 2020

### Recording

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to enable the participants to *meet and discuss the roadmap of deliverables*
2. Introduction of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share)
3. Guides and Processes - introduction to the topic by Dan Gisolfi
  - a. <https://github.com/trustoverip/deliverables/issues/4> - call-to-action is to build on the guides already existing as exemplars and across the Foundation come up with templates relevant to the work underway
  - b. You will need to join the ToIP organization on GitHub (however, that is not a barrier to the contributions); additionally you will likely need a Linux Foundation account (membership) as per Drummond
4. GSWG Leadership Updates
  - a. See [slides](#) from the All Members meeting
5. Activities since our last NA/EU call
  - a. Recap of GSWG APAC Call - [sankarshan](#)
    - i. Notes can be found [here](#) (hat tip to Scott Perry for his scribe role)
    - ii. Summary
      1. Introduction to the Governance Architecture TF with some extensive conversation around how it all fits in
      2. Encouraging the group to think deeply over the Critical Success Factors - as how it can help shape future growth of the group
      3. A high level introduction to the Health ID plan proposed by the Union Government of India - there have been sporadic discussions on various channels about it. The group also encourages participating members to share any proposal /policy document so that there is an increase in level of awareness and a structured approach to unpacking the proposals along the mission, values and vision of the Foundation.
6. Presentation Topics - Key Deliverables from our Group
  - a. GSWG Status Slides to ToIP All-Member Meeting - An in-depth discussion - All
    - i. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - Some of the work going on in the industry across various groups (Sovrin, Bedrock, etc.) - How is this group going to leverage frameworks from these groups for the benefit of ToIP?
    - ii. [Scott Perry](#) - We are very much open and looking forward to these inputs. Taking it even further at a next level - we are also looking for more such inputs from across regions like APAC.
    - iii. [Scott Whitmire](#) - We need to look at what kind of standards are required - at each layer - so that someone who is willing to develop something, should be able to see what and how to utilise from these standards.
    - iv. [Karl Kneis](#) - One of the challenges with the stack and governance is it is too large to scope. We need to categorise the governance and how that operates at scale and at various layers
  - b. Roadmap of GSWG Deliverables (Drummond)
    - i. [Drummond Reed](#) - Purpose: is not to say "Hey we have got the roadmap here" This is rather a conversation starter. We are really just focusing on next 3,6,9,12 months of roadmap. Six deliverable types - Specifications, Templates, Definitions, Recommendations, Implementation Plan, White papers. Deliverables will be organised in accordance with the stack.
    - ii. **Specifications** - TOIP Governance Architecture TSS and ToIP M/C readable GF TSS.

1. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - TSWG has plan to spread the specs across layers, is that also going to be the case in GSWG? [Drummond Reed](#) - All these specs will be full stack - not layer specific
  - iii. **Templates** - At least 4 core templates we see to be delivered, one each for the layers - ToIP Layer 1 Governance Framework Template, ToIP Layer 2 and so on.
    1. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - From priority stand point, this is good, because it helps to understand what is needed at respective layer to start with.
    2. [Scott Perry](#) - GSWG - [Processes & Roles TF](#) is focusing on defining processes and their alignment with evolving specifications and templates.
  - iv. <https://wiki.trustoverip.org/display/HOME/Governance+Layer+ProcessesDefinitions> - Definitions and Glossary are very much needed - these save hours if you have the definitions in place. We can't make definitions in absence of technology terminologies - so there will be a joint work with the TSWG as well.
    1. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - We need to settle on how do we bring the terminology. We need to kind of look at each term at a very granular level. Is the GSWG going to have glossary as a corpus of the group?
    2. [Drummond Reed](#) - We will be the consumer of lots of terms/definitions from other groups as well.
    3. [Scott Perry](#) - Now that we have the [Concepts and Terminology](#) group in place - they should be the owner of the terminologies and definitions while all the groups can provide inputs.
  - v. **Recommendations** - Design principles for ToIP GF. 4 Policy Recommendations (1 per layer) | 4 Best Practices Recommendations (1 per layer)
    1. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - There has to be alignment while we recommend best practices. We should assume that [C&T](#) will be required to minimally produce 4 glossaries (1 per WG)
  - vi. **White Papers** - White paper - one per quarter starting Q4-2020.
    1. [Scott Whitmire](#) - What about a white paper that describes a prototype ecosystem from top to bottom presented in narrative story form?
    2. [Drummond Reed](#) - That sounds like a good deliverable for the Ecosystem Foundry WG that we and the TSWG could contribute to.
    3. Suggestion from [Dan Gisolfi](#) - We should leverage outlines from Sovrin and BBU and you have a starter.
  - c. First Look - Class Definitions of Verifiable Credentials (Scott Perry)
    - i. [Scott Perry](#) - There are lot of communities, groups that have done lot of vetting on standards to do with identity services.
    - ii. [Drummond Reed](#) - LoA could be defined for any type of verifiable credential if it's needed—but it's highly contextual
    - iii. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - We need to use Scott's example content to make a point. How do we classify this Trust Assurance content - Is it in a template? Recommendation? Other? In my opinion, it is a Recommendation.
    - iv. [Kalyan Kulkarni](#) - It certainly is more a recommendation in its current form - but has a great potential to be transformed into templates - one for each class.
    - v. [Scott Whitmire](#) - Another recommendation would be which class is best for a given type of credential.
  - vi. Preview of Credentials Policy Template
    1. [Scott Perry](#) - It is going to provide lot of education and information which is needed at the current stage
    2. [Dan Gisolfi](#) - All good comments BUT we must strive for CONSUMABILITY of our workproducts. If ToIP is too complex it will be a hit against us. EFWG and UFWG will have more consumers - If there is lot of granularity in the work products, it becomes harder to consume.
7. Open Discussion -
- a. Purpose of Bi-Weekly Meetings and Topics for future meetings
  - b. Critical Success Factors in the adoption of ToIP deliverables (the items listed below are intended to be a starter set) -
    - i. CSF 1: Agree on what is an ecosystem?
    - ii. CSF2: Define the criteria to prove possession of a private key used to sign VCs
    - iii. CSF 3: The set of due diligence required to sign a VC with a stated level of assurance
    - iv. CSF 4: Agree on the Stack diagram
    - v. CSF 4: Define the role of a governance authority over an ecosystem
  - c. Outreach and engagement from ToIP members

## APAC Meeting - Wednesday 9 September 2020

**Note:** [New Meeting Bridge](#) - <https://zoom.us/j/97481438286> - All future APAC GSWG call will take place on the new Zoom meeting

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:lists.trustoverip.org)).

Recording is

Presentation link is [here](#)

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to enable the participants to **meet and discuss key deliverables from our group**
2. Introduction of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share)
3. GSWG Leadership Updates
  - a. Drummond Reed back from sabbatical - Starting up [Governance Architecture TF](#) in September (see item 6.b)
4. Activities since our last APAC call
5. Presentation Topics -
  - a. Key Deliverables from our GroupToIP Ecosystem Foundry Working Group (Karl Kneis) - a key topic to address will how an ecosystem with leverage a governance framework
  - a. Walk through the Foundry Concepts and Workflow
    - i. Discussion of needs of the GSWG for the Foundry
  - b. Drummond Reed - [Launching the Governance Architecture Task Force](#)
    - i. Reason and Mission of Task Force
      1. Create a ToIP Standard Specification that defines the standard requirements for all ToIP compatible governance frameworks
      2. Strawman requirements for a Governance Architecture TSS was presented
    - ii. Potential Deliverables from TF
      1. Meta Model of contents of a GF



- iii. Solicitation of Members
    - 1. Wiki Page
    - 2. Dedicated Slack channel
    - 3. Zoom meetings
- 6. Planned and Open Discussion / Q&A
  - a. Critical Success Factors in the adoption of ToIP deliverables (the items listed below are intended to be a starter set) - Scott has asked that for this meeting we work through the critical success factors which determine the deliverables. Also see [this link](#).
    - i. CSF 1: Agree on what is an ecosystem?
    - ii. CSF2: Define the criteria to prove possession of a private key used to sign VCs
    - iii. CSF 3: The set of due diligence required to sign a VC with a stated level of assurance Agree on the Stack diagram
    - iv. CSF 4: Define the role of a governance authority over an ecosystem
  - b. Outreach and engagement from ToIP members
  - a. Policy Updates and Announcements from APAC (53 minutes into the meeting)
    - i. Government of India has issued standards for Health ID
      - 1. For views, remarks, discussions please use the Slack channel or our mailing list
- 7. Open Discussion / Q&A
  - a. Opportunities for APAC GSWG to contribute in existing or new TFs, Use Cases, etc. / other regional topics
  - b. Topics for future meetings:

## NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 3 September 2020

Recording: [https://zoom.us/rec/share/YXm-fyTgQmomqjeTP6pK8bK9bPELdaSZFDzod8NoaTcd4y6XD4aKZ5dhfu0w8t6o.adVO\\_PxHae54A3IC](https://zoom.us/rec/share/YXm-fyTgQmomqjeTP6pK8bK9bPELdaSZFDzod8NoaTcd4y6XD4aKZ5dhfu0w8t6o.adVO_PxHae54A3IC)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

- 1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to enable the participants to **meet and discuss key deliverables from our group**
  - b. Introduction of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share)
    - i. Darrell O'Donnell, Continuum Loop Inc. - Ottawa, CANADA
    - ii. Khalid Maliki, Tykn B.V. NL
  - c. GSWG Leadership Updates
    - i. Drummond Reed back from sabbatical - Starting up [Governance Architecture TF](#) in September (see item 6.b)
  - d. Activities since our last NA/EU call
  - a. Recap of GSWG APAC Call - [Kalyan Kulkarni](#)
    - i. Notes from the meeting and next set of tasks can be found [here](#).
      - 1. News from India presentation
      - ii. Status of [Ideas to Deliverables, A Trust Over IP Workflow Proposal](#) - [Steven Milstein](#) & Sankarshan
      - iii. Status of [Process & Roles / Trust Assurance efforts](#) - Scott Perry
        - 1. Trust Assurance Primer ready for comment - link [here](#)
          - a. Scott has been working on more concrete ideas on deliverables; likely through a task force.
      - iv. Status of Governance Library Repository - Steve Magennis
        - 1. David will be enabling a formal repository (from a set of avenues); more updates are TBD
      - v. Related Industry Activities - Open Call for member updates
    - b. Presentation Topics - Key Deliverables from our Group
      - i. ToIP Ecosystem Foundry Working Group (Karl Kneis) - a key topic to address will how an ecosystem with leverage a governance framework
        - 1. Walk through the Foundry Concepts and Workflow
          - a. Tom Smedinghoff - definitions of a governance framework needs to be included while scoping definition for what makes an ecosystem
          - b. Discussion of needs of the GSWG for the Foundry
        - 2. Drummond Reed - [Launching the Governance Architecture Task Force](#)
          - a. Reason and Mission of Task Force
            - i. creating a specific against which compliance can be measured
          - b. Potential Deliverables from TF
          - c. Solicitation of Members
  - c. Planned and Open Discussion / Q&A
    - i. Critical Success Factors in the adoption of ToIP deliverables (the items listed below are intended to be a starter set) - Scott has asked that for this meeting we work through the critical success factors which determine the deliverables. Also see [this link](#).
      - 1. CSF 1: Agree on what is an ecosystem?
      - a. CSF2: Define the criteria to prove possession of a private key used to sign VCs
      - b. CSF 3: The set of due diligence required to sign a VC with a stated level of assurance Agree on the Stack diagram
      - c. CSF 4: Define the role of a governance authority over an ecosystem
    - 2. Outreach and engagement from ToIP members
- d. Other Announcements
  - i. Concepts and Terminology WG kicks off on 14-Sep-2020
- e. Topics for future meetings
  - i. Corda Foundation Network (Carolynne Quinn, Executive Director)
    - 1. ISO Blockchain Technical Committee (Emily Dawson)
    - 2. Credential Master (Timothy Ruff, Interim CEO)
    - 3. <Contribute/Propose name>

## APAC Meeting - Wednesday 26 August 2020

**Note: [New Meeting Bridge](#) - <https://zoom.us/j/97481438286> - All future APAC GSWG call will take place on the new Zoom meeting**

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

Recording is [here](#).

Presentation link is [here](#)

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy (4 minutes into the start time)
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to enable the participants to **meet and interact with our new Program Manager Dave Luchuk** and to get update on work done so far under Trust Assurance, Roles & Process TFs
    - i. Introductory notes from Kalyan
  - b. Introductions of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share) (5 mins into the meeting)
    - i. John Phillips - Working in SSI for the last 3.5 years, helping to explain the concepts and benefits to educational and commercial organisations as well as government bodies. Co-chair of the Sovrin Foundation's Working Group on Guardianship and creator of that popsicle sticks and foam figure explanation of SSI on [ssimeetup.org](http://ssimeetup.org).
  - c. GSWG Leadership Updates - (10 minutes into the meeting)
    - i. Recap of GSWG EU Call - [sankarshan](#)
      1. Notes from the meeting and next set of tasks can be found [here](#).
  - d. Presentation Topic - Getting to know ToIP new Program Manager Dave Luchuk (11 minutes into the meeting)
    - i. John Phillips - can all of this be done or do we need to find what to scope and review existing work
    - ii. Alex - how does work in this WG intersect with PCTF work underway
    - iii. Kalyan - the APAC teams are yet to begin contributions into ongoing ToIP work - what specific asks does Dave have on APAC?
  - e. Presentation Topic - Dive into the work done so far in Trust Assurance and Roles & Processes TF (15 minutes) - [Scott Perry](#) (42 minutes into the meeting)
    - i. [Trust Assurance Development Kit](#) - call-for-action to review the primer and evaluate in the context of the deliverables of the Trust Assurance Task Force deliverables
    - ii. [IETF RFC 3647](#) - Scott would like to create an issuer (of VCs) document similar to this RFC would pull in the technical aspects
  - f. Policy Updates and Announcements from APAC (53 minutes into the meeting)
    - i. News from India - [Government announced - National Digital Health Blueprint](#) - Potential for leveraging TOIP work (5 mins) - [Kalyan Kulkarni](#)
      1. For views, remarks, discussions please use the Slack channel or our mailing list
  - g. Open Discussion / Q&A
    - i. Opportunities for APAC GSWG to contribute in existing or new TFs, Use Cases, etc. / other regional topics
  - h. Topics for future meetings:
    - i. Public Initiative in Kochi, India to form a consortia for issuance of digital identity to the citizens.
    - ii. Quick peek at "Digital Health ID" Initiative in India - How a govt driven governance model may shape up
    - iii. Participation by few industry veterans
    - iv. <Contribute/Propose name>

## NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 20 August 2020

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:lists.trustoverip.org)).

- Google Recorder [Transcripts](#) (*unedited*)
  - [Recording](#)

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to enable the participants to **meet and interact with our new Program Manager Dave Luchuk**
  - b. Introduction of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share)
    - i. No new members at this instance of the meeting
  - c. GSWG Leadership Updates
    - i. Drummond Reed on sabbatical for August - Starting up [Governance Architecture TF](#) in September
  - d. Activities since our last NA/EU call
  - a. Recap of GSWG APAC Call - [Kalyan Kulkarni](#)
    - i. Notes from the meeting and next set of tasks can be found [here](#).
    - ii. Status of [Ideas to Deliverables, A Trust Over IP Workflow Proposal](#) - [Steven Milstein](#) & Sankarshan
      1. Quick introduction by Steven (for David Luchuk - more follow-up to be done to see where we can go with this)
    - iii. Status of [GSWG Process & Roles TF](#) - Scott Perry
      1. Scott has created and updated a list of roles and processes on the wiki; call-for-review with invitation to edit/add /modify existing list. How does the existing static governance (layer) diagram evolve. Scott is planning to advance the Trust Assurance specifics.
      2. Open discussion [discussion of escrow services](#) (original introduced as a topic by Daniel Hardman)
    - iv. Status of Governance Library Repository - Steve Magennis
      1. No new updates to the library - presently being maintained in a personal Google Drive and hopefully can be more formal and structured (say GitHub etc)
    - v. Plan for Creation of Trust Assurance Task Force - Scott Perry
      1. ToIP Trust Assurance Development Kit V.10 document available for comment [here](#)
        - a. This is a follow-up from the introductory session on this topic from Scott.
        - b. A more formal TF around Trust Assurance would be set up subsequent to better inventory of actors, roles and processes are developed.
        - c. [Chris Ingrao](#) as part of Trust Assurance, are you considering Layer 4 <-> Layer 4 governance?
          - i. Scott - yes. Also wait for the Governance Architecture TF being set up
      2. Open topic of discussion: What will it mean for an implementation of a governance model or even full ecosystem to be ToIP 'compliant'?
        - a. [Steve Magennis](#) - are we simply providing guiding/insight or are we looking to do something that some level of compliance can be ascertained. This end outcome concept is what is important to keep in mind. There are multi-dimensional questions more around brownfield deployments come up.
    - vi. Related Industry Activities - Open Call for member updates

- b. Presentation Topic -Getting to know ToIP new Program Director Dave Luchuk
  - i. phenomenal exposition of Dave's journey through identity space and government - please watch recording.
- c. Open Discussion / Q&A
  - i. how to reach out to Dave [dluchuk@contractor.linuxfoundation.org](mailto:dluchuk@contractor.linuxfoundation.org)
- d. Topics for future meetings
  - i. Corda Foundation Network (Carolynne Quinn, Executive Director)
    - 1. ISO Blockchain Technical Committee (Emily Dawson)
    - 2. Credential Master (Timothy Ruff, Interim CEO)
    - 3. <Contribute/Propose name>

## APAC Meeting - Wednesday 12 August 2020

**Note:** *New Meeting Bridge* - <https://zoom.us/j/97481438286> - All future APAC GSWG call will take place on the new Zoom meeting

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. Introductions of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share)
  - b. GSWG Leadership Updates - 5 minutes
    - i. Drummond Reed on Writing Sabbatical for August
    - ii. Roles and Processes TF led by Scott
    - iii. Liaison page - [Liaisons with Standards Organizations](#) (please provide detail if you are working with other standards and like organizations)
      1. [Victor Golubkov](#) - bringing his focus on education and digital identity credentials for learners; waiting for the Internet of Education TF to commence.
        - a. [Modeling of educational credentials](#) is on-going work
      2. Catherine - the DIF Interop WG is likely going to have impact
      3. Alex - there is a need for integrating the governance into the use cases (for the CCI initiative) to enable scaling up
    - iv. Jim's introduction to the Patient Identity Task Force - to focus on patient processes and information and patient identity
  - c. Presentation Topic -
    - i. Scott Perry - Commencement of Trust Assurance TF - 10 minutes
      1. Introduction to the need and concepts around Trust Assurance
        - a. Laying out why work around governance framework needs to consider trust criteria and risks
      2. Call to Action (for the TF to be announced)
    - ii. Catherine Nabbala (Finema, Bangkok) - 20 minutes - Work being done by Finema in Thailand - Approach taken to encourage the government to participate in the initiative.
      1. Finema provides a decentralized identity solution comprised of IDIN Blockchain (private), IDIN IAM and Wallet
      2. Trust Triangle based solution available for public health, education, retail, finance, legal identity and devices
      3. Approach to new tech adoption - awareness/education; basic use cases around VCs; interoperability; assistance with drafting guidelines
        - a. identity custodian approach rather than "pure" SSI (which is likely to have some strides to take before wider adoption)
  - d. Open Discussion / Q&A
    - i. Opportunities for APAC GSWG to contribute in existing or new TFs, Use Cases, etc. / other regional topics
    - ii. Readiness of the reference stack from ToIP will help influence the government adoption; availability of content in the local language helps
      1. Scott - active participation in driving the above requirement is going to be useful

## NA/EU Meeting - Thursday 6 August 2020

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. The objective of this WG meeting is to enable the participants to ***become familiar with the concepts of Trust Assurance***
  - b. Introduction of new members - 5 minutes (Please use the format: Name / Affiliation / Location / any other detail you would like to share)
    - i. Karen Hand, Precision Strategic Solutions in Puslinch ON Canada
    - ii. Melanie Nuce GS1 (standing in for Gena Morgan)
    - iii. Sergio CEO at Tangem (card based DID VC wallet)
    - iv. [Daniel Bachenheimer](#) , Accenture Washington DC
    - v. [Paul Knowles](#) , Human Colossus Foundation & Convenor of ToIP Decentralized Semantics WG, based in Switzerland
  - c. GSWG Leadership Updates
    - i. Drummond Reed on sabbatical for August - Starting up [Governance Architecture TF](#) in September
    - ii. [Kalyan Kulkarni](#) is stepping into the Co-Chair role - leading APAC calls
      1. around 12 member participation
      2. more of an ice breaker call - getting the team familiar with work done so far
      3. upcoming ideas and tasks came up for discussion
  - d. Presentation Topic - **Trust Assurance 101** - [Scott Perry](#) (30 mins) Link to Presentation ([here](#))
    - i. (Call To Action) Please review the existing list of Credential Risks and add new ones if required
    - ii. Matthew - on the topic of "Algorithmic Trust" ie. trust in data workflows - issues there are more to do with data provenance and algorithmic transparency and auditing - does it fit within the framework
      1. Scott - it is part of the scope - the viability of the algorithm (human designed or machine created) needs trust assurance but in a potentially different way
    - iii. Paul - is "risk" at the VC level or individual attributes within a VC?
      1. Scott - it can be both. We have to start with the ecosystem trust level - the ecosystem managers who are issuing a class of transactions of verifiable credentials.
        - a. (ACTION ITEM) Paul - a "risk overlay" proposal in the Overlays Capture Architecture is something which can be included in the roadmap of the project



- e. Activities since our last NA/EU call
- a. Recap of First GSWG APAC Call - Kalyan Kulkarni
  - i. Notes from the meeting and next set of tasks can be found [here](#).
  - ii. Status of [Ideas to Deliverables, A Trust Over IP Workflow Proposal](#) - Steven Milstein & Sankarshan
    - 1. Will be presenting the concept at the upcoming APAC call
    - 2. To be discussed with David Luchuk to seek refinement towards further adoption in one pilot flow
    - 3. Scott - everyone comes in with different levels of participation; what we are trying to do is maximize everyone's agenda. There is a need for ground level understanding for the concepts.
  - iii. Recap of GSWG Process & Roles TF Kickoff - Scott Perry
    - 1. Notes from the kick-off meeting including next steps can be found [here](#).
    - 2. Needed to advance the ToIP diagram further by identifying the roles and associated processes within the layers.. The process and roles inventory would help anchor that for other activities which are built around it
  - iv. Status of Governance Library Repository - Steve Magennis
    - 1. (Call To Action) Examples of 10 framework included in the repository. Please get in touch with [Steve Magennis](#) if you have additional framework to include
    - 2. (ACTION ITEM) Steve working on an ongoing framework when you build a trust ecosystem from scratch - look forward to a paper
  - v. Related Industry Activities - Open Call for member updates
- b. Open Discussion / Q&A
  - i. [Mark Lizar](#) - part of Standards Council of Canada. Creation of keywords for data governance and leading to a comprehensive search for all the keywords.
    - 1. (ACTION ITEM) Currently working on creating categories of the standards and will be willing to share the output for that work.
    - 2. [Daniel Bachenheimer](#) (please fill out this bit, missed adding the specifics of the groups) - reaching out to Emily Dawson ISO TC 307 - ToIP will have a liaison to this
    - 3. [Jim St.Clair](#) - unsure if there is already a decision that ToIP will not be an accreditation body or at least support one
- c. Topics for future meetings
  - i. Corda Foundation Network (Carolyne Quinn, Executive Director)
    - 1. ISO Blockchain Technical Committee (Emily Dawson)
    - 2. Credential Master (Timothy Ruff, Interim CEO)
    - 3. <Contribute/Propose name>

## APAC Meeting - Wednesday 29 July 2020

Recording: [https://zoom.us/rec/share/uctPP6\\_P739JXtb8whDUcl4IAYLmT6a81CJM\\_\\_dezB1pZ-eGyXPra3AOC\\_JINs53](https://zoom.us/rec/share/uctPP6_P739JXtb8whDUcl4IAYLmT6a81CJM__dezB1pZ-eGyXPra3AOC_JINs53)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Welcome to attendees and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. Introductory notes from Kalyan
    - i. Introductions from participants
      1. Scott Perry
      2. Steven Milstein
      3. Eric Drury - independent consultant in DLT and supply chain
      4. Vinod
      5. Drummond Reed
  - b. New member introductions
    - i. Eric Chou, Snowbridge
      1. digital certificates to help prove ownership of land
    - ii. Alex David, South Korea
      1. DID based system
    - iii. Victor Syntez - educational professional from Victoria BC. I've got interested in blockchain and ID about a year ago. I consider that SSI can bring incredible change to education field and would like to contribute to that improvement. I hope to help TOIP in that.
    - iv. Kazuto Yoshimura - BTC Cooperation, a Japanese IT consulting company. I have just started to learn the ToIP governance stacks, and I'm curious how the specifications are going to be explored here
    - v. Catherine Nabbala, Finema - Global Coordinator for Finema. We are an Enterprise Decentralized Identity Platform based in Bangkok, Thailand.
  - c. Reviewing the [mission](#) of the Governance Stack WG
    - i. Drummond's introduction to the Layers in the ToIP stack
  - d. Recap of work done from EU/NA meeting - TFs, TSS, TIPs, convening of first two [Task Forces](#)
  - e. Open Discussion - Opportunities for APAC GSWG to contribute in existing or new TFs, Use Cases, etc. / other regional topics
    - i. Kalyan - introduction around the hackathon themed for the National Health Stack; absence of health regulations
    - ii. Drummond - "trust is contextual" - there are universal aspects to it (authentication/authorization). digital trust ecosystem includes culture, law and social norms
    - iii. Vinod - including the concept of DID (thinking about decentralized identity - is important to position use cases etc re-purpose and present it for local context). *"interoperable but specific for each trust community"* (quote from Drummond as response to Vinod's inputs)
    - iv. sankarshan - taking the time between now and the next meeting to create specific work items to focus and start work on
  - f. Meeting Bridge - <https://zoom.us/j/96644380375>

**Note:** All future APAC GSWG call will take place on a different Zoom meeting. Details for Zoom meeting will be communicated separately though.

Thursday 23 July 2020

POST-MEETING: [Presentation](#) (Google Slides) — Meeting [recording](#)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. Introduction of new members - 5 minutes
    - i. Alex Tweeddale - IDWorks, London - Building decentralized stack on Corda. Has specialization with GDPR compliance
  - b. GSWG Leadership Updates
    - i. Co-Chair /Vice Chair Announcement - 5 minutes - Scott
      1. Tom Plagge has volunteered to end his services as a Co-Chair (COVID-19 and home schooling issues)
      2. Kalyan Kulkarni would be stepping into the Co-Chair role
    - ii. Announcement of First GSWG APAC Call - Kalyan Kulkarni - 5 minutes
      1. Agenda for APAC calls (see above for the agenda of the kick-off meeting)
        - a. Please help us with outreach around the APAC call/meeting
    - iii. Governance Library Repository - 5 minutes - Steve Magennis
      1. [GSWG Framework Library](#)
        - a. intended to help people with existing governance framework and gaining familiarity
        - b. helps form concrete ideas to create deliverables
        - c. if you have a framework - please contribute that and add to the Summary page
        - d. Governance Framework library would be key to gaining best practices
  - c. Convening our first GSWG Task Forces (Chairs & Vice Chairs—10 mins)
    - i. First active TFs
      1. [Governance Architecture](#) - Drummond - 5 minutes
        - a. Will be producing the "anchor" ToIP Standard Specification for the ToIP Governance Stack
          - i. will allow to measure conformance against
          - ii. TSS (internal, external or hybrid)
          - iii. Self Certification or 3rd party certification - all of these would need a TSS, which is the objective
        - b. TF model allows usage of resources available to complete the planning and work towards the outcome
        - c. Please refer to the ToIP Deliverables document (living document)
        - d. Will be using the GitHub workflow (markdown document)
        - e. How to join
          - i. add name to wiki page
          - ii. join Slack channel (#gswg-gov-architecture-tf)
          - iii. mailing list coming up
          - iv. Meetings coming up in Sep (Drummond is on writing sabbatical through August)
      2. [Process & Roles](#) - Scott Perry - 5 minutes
        - a. Complementary to the TF explained by Drummond (see above)
        - b. Two aspects driving this
          - i. members across a range of vantage points of the VC ecosystem
          - ii. who has the entire picture (the stack diagram - [the concept RFC](#)) - we need to go beyond that to build out the inventory for all the roles and processes at each layer of the stack. This will be needed by all layers
        - c. We could review the existing diagram in terms of whether it is the best visual representation
        - d. Existing sources can help in building the processes and roles (see slide for a representative list and Steve's Governance Framework Example Library)
        - e. How to join
          - i. starting next week
          - ii. all members announcement to be made
          - iii. Join Slack channel (#gswg-process-and-roles-tf)
          - iv. GitHub based workflow
    - ii. Other planned TFs
      1. [Trust Assurance](#) - Scott Perry - 3 mins
  - d. [Ideas to Deliverables, A Trust Over IP Workflow Proposal](#) - Steven Milstein & Sankarshan - 15 minutes
    - i. Presentation of a proposal
    - ii. Follow up meeting planned to work on refining the idea
      1. reach out to Steven (slack, email) for joining the meeting
  - e. Open Discussion / Q&A
    - i. Scott Whitmire's question on Slack - is in the process of IEEE standard which may be an ecosystem of medical information. Drummond has a comment that an ecosystem can have one or more TIPs. For the L4 framework Scott is writing how much detail does he have to go? How does all this fit together?
      1. Drummond - For a L4 GF, one should be able to reference in a manner as "will rely on the following frameworks". Or, specifically set up the requirements to enable a L1 to qualify through a predefined process
  - f. Topics for future meetings
    - i. Corda Foundation Network (Carolynne Quinn, Executive Director)
    - ii. Trust Assurance 101 (Scott Perry, Convener)
    - iii. ISO Blockchain Technical Committee (Emily Dawson)
    - iv. Credential Master (Timothy Ruff, Interim CEO)
    - v. <Contribute/Propose name>

Thursday 09 July 2020

[Presentation](#) (Google Slides) — Meeting [recording](#)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. Introduction of new members
    - i. Ajay Jadhav - Vice Chair Technology Stack - APAC

- ii. Khalid Maliki
- b. Review of GSWG mission and deliverables
- c. Presentation on ToIP Deliverables (Drummond—20 mins)
- d. Assembling our first two GSWG Task Forces (Chairs & Vice Chairs—20 mins)
  - i. ToIP Governance Architecture TSS
    - 1. Deliverable stages - DRAFT to Publish
    - 2. Five types of deliverables - Spec, Template, Recommendation, Implementation Plan (more attributed to Foundry groups), White Paper
    - 3. Spec - TSS and TIP
    - 4. TSS - Internal (ToIP). External (Other Standards Body) or Hybrid Developed
    - 5. Mapping should be done from ToIP deliverables to input to the Global Standards Org - Volunteers?
    - 6. TSS can be submitted to global standards orgs (like W3C)
    - 7. Need for TSS that specifies technical requirements for ToIP Governance Frameworks - Part of Task Force
    - 8. Rec - Best Practice, Guidance and Glossary
  - ii. ToIP Interoperability Profile
    - 1. Communication between ToIP layers
    - 2. More aligned to Technology Stack - GSWG not producing TIPs
    - 3. TIP includes suite of accompanying deliverables for development and implementation support
  - iii. Templates - Majority deliverable from GSWG
  - iv. Recommendations - Best Practices, Guidelines and Glossaries
  - v. ToIP Utility Governance Framework Templates
    - 1. ToIP utility layer template, building on Sovrin & others, can describe Layer 1 processes and serve as a model for other layers
- e. Task Force Ideas
  - i. Governance Layer Process Descriptions
    - 1. Working space: [Governance Layer Processes](#)
- f. Open Discussion / Q&A
  - i. APAC support
- g. Topics for future meetings
  - i. Carolyn Quinn - Executive Director - Corda Foundation Network
  - ii. Scott Perry - Trust Assurance 101
  - iii. ISO Blockchain Technical Committee Manager - Emily Dawson

Thursday 25 June 2020

Meeting [recording](#)

Send an email to [governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org](mailto:governance-stack-wg@lists.trustoverip.org) to request a calendar invite (you can subscribe to the mailing list at [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org)).

1. Welcome and Linux Foundation antitrust policy
  - a. Introduction of new members - 33 attendees
    - i. Carly Huitema - Guelph, Canada
    - ii. Trevor Butterworth - Ireland
    - iii. Tom Smedinghoff - Lawyer Private practice - Chicago - ABA Committee on Trust Frameworks
  - b. Deciding on chairs, vice chairs, and terms
    - i. Chair nominees
      1. Scott Perry
      2. Tom Plagge
      3. Drummond Reed
    - ii. Vice Chair nominees
      1. Steve Magennis
      2. Steven Milstein
      3. Sankarshan
      4. Kalyan Kulkarni
    - iii. Proposed terms ("duty cycles")
      1. Proposal to have an election in 2 months
  - c. Presentation on machine-readable governance frameworks—Daniel Hardman
    - i. <https://github.com/hyperledger/aries-rfcs/blob/master/concepts/0430-machine-readable-governance-frameworks/README.md>
    - ii. Transfer legally bound policy decisions into software functionality
    - iii. JSON code in example
    - iv. User experience - thought experiment - Higher education - Germany
      1. issuance of digital diploma
      2. describes trust rules
      3. name and version of governance framework
      4. Burden on user side?
      5. Common metadata fields needs to be flushed out
      6. Terms of Service needs to be included
      7. Rules conveying Issuer and Verifier Assertions
      8. Could have non-conformance communicated to Governance Authority or Auditors
      9. Could include "verifying the verifier" capabilities or triggering automatic actions by an agent to perform this automatically
      10. GLEIF records can be used to vetting entities in the process
      11. Verifiers can be excluded upon conditions
      12. A machine-readable governance framework could also automate the process of doing the "verifying the verifier" task
    - v. Terms of Service can be integrated
    - vi. Also redress and audit
    - vii. A machine-readable governance framework can also be versioned like any other software, but this needs to be carefully managed so as to maintain continuity

- d. Next steps on Governance Template Task Force
  - i. Discussion of **ToIP Work Products and Deliverables**
    - 1. Specs and templates for joint deliverables being written - five different kinds - to be discussed at a future meeting
    - 2. TSS — ToIP Standard Specification
  - ii. Proposal: focus on two initial deliverables:
    - 1. **ToIP Governance Architecture** — a TSS defining the overall model and requirements for ToIP-compatible governance frameworks
    - 2. **ToIP Layer One Utility Governance Framework Templates** — a set of templates that implement the ToIP Governance Architecture for a Layer One utility
- e. Topics for Future Meetings
  - i. Scott Perry - Trust Assurance 101
  - ii. <your topic here>

Thursday 11 June 2020

Meeting [recording](#)

1. Status since last meeting (Scott, Tom, Drummond) - 5 minutes
  - a. 29 attendees
    - i. New Introductions
      1. Scott Whitmire IEEE - Standard for medical Imaging
      2. Gena Morgan - GS1 - Standards in Supply Chain
      3. Will Groah IEEE working with other ToIP groups
      4. AJ Finema - Bangkok, Governance Blockchain Decentralized identity consultant
      5. Gene DiMira - Manulife - AML Compliance Officer
    - ii. New whitepapers, templates, thought leadership documents should be sent to Scott Perry [scott@scottperrycpa.com](mailto:scott@scottperrycpa.com)
  - b. Templatizing a Utility Governance Framework based on Sovrin Governance Framework (Drummond - 15 min)
    - i. [Google Slides are here](#)
    - ii. Sovrin Governance Framework - started in 2016, now at V2 including GDPR conformance in December 2019 - working group of over 50 members
    - iii. Modular Framework of documents including a Home Page, Master Document, Glossary, Legal Agreements, Controlled Documents and a Trust Assurance Framework
    - iv. Key best practices
      1. Modular design
      2. Must include legal agreements and legal teams
      3. One glossary for entire framework
      4. Roles and responsibilities
      5. Affiliated trust assurance framework
      6. Non-normative but accessible framework
    - v. Tour of the Sovrin Governance Framework - available on web at [sovrin.org](http://sovrin.org)
    - vi. Templatize the Sovrin work
      1. Tailored to Layer one but structure can be used as an overarching model for ToIP GSWG
  - c. Example templates from the Brighthouse Repository (Tom - 10 minutes)
    - i. Brighthouse has focused on Data Trust (aligned to Layer 4)
    - ii. Governance established through a data trust agreement (DTA) - on web at [github.com/brighthive/data-trust-legal](https://github.com/brighthive/data-trust-legal)
    - iii. Roles and responsibilities - Better when there is a strong central authority
    - iv. Brighthouse has examples in [github](#)
    - v. Framework adopted from the Intelligence Industry, Canada efforts
    - vi. Good examples from Goodwill Industries and the Commonwealth of Virginia
  - d. Open Discussion
    - i. Don't Boil the Ocean - Tackle progressive steps
    - ii. Next Steps - Establish your own task force
    - iii. Start producing Tools
      1. Standard Specification on Governance Framework Template Model
      2. Not Layer Specific - At an Architecture Level
      3. email soliciting interest in framework architecture design
      4. email soliciting other areas that members want to tackle
  - e. Topics for Future Meetings - Contact Scott Perry, Drummond Reed or Tom Plagge
    - i. Daniel Hardman - <https://github.com/hyperledger/aries-rfcs/blob/master/concepts/0430-machine-readable-governance-frameworks/README.md>
    - ii. Scott Perry - Trust Assurance 101

Thursday 28 May 2020

See [this Google Slides presentation](#) for the full agenda. Summary:

1. Welcome from the conveners (Scott, Tom, Drummond—5 min)
  - a. Introductions (15 min)
    - i. Natarajan (Nat) Chandrasekhar – Cambridge, UK – individual contributor
    - ii. Dan Bacheneheimer – Washington, DC – Accenture Digital Identity group
    - iii. Stu Vaeth – Boston, MA – Mastercard
    - iv. Bryn Robinson-Morgan – UK – Mastercard
    - v. Arjun Govind – Philadelphia, PA (Bangalore for the moment) – Digital identity at R3
    - vi. Catherine Nabbala – Bangkok – Finema
    - vii. Dan Gisolfi – New York, NY – IBM
    - viii. Elizabeth Cronan – Washington, DC – Geoguard
    - ix. Eric Welton – Northern Thailand – Individual contributor

- x. Gregor Jehle – Stuttgart, Germany – P3KI
- xi. Jim StClair – Mississippi – Dinocrates
- xii. Jan Lindquist – Stockholm – Hyperledger
- xiii. John Jordan – British Columbia – Province of British Columbia
- xiv. Mark Lizar – Toronto, Canada / UK – Open Consent
- xv. Mark Scott – San Diego, CA – Individual contributor
- xvi. Mary Lacity – Fayetteville, AK – Sam Walton College of Business
- xvii. Matt Davies – Salt Lake City, UT – Finicity
- xviii. Paul Knowles – Switzerland – Human Colossus Foundation
- xix. Robin Alexander – Vancouver, BC – Geoguard
- xx. Steve Magennis – Seattle, WA – Polywug
- xxi. Steven Milstein – Montreal, CA – Collab Ventures
- xxii. Sankarshan Mukhopadhyay – Bengaluru, India – Dhiway
- xxiii. Vinod Panicker – Kochi, India – Wipro
- xxiv. Vipin Bharathan – New York, NY – dlt.nyc
- xxv. Wenjing Chu – Santa Clara, CA – Futureway Technologies
- xxvi. Will Groah
- xxvii. Xinxin Fan – San Francisco Bay Area, US – LaTeX
- xxviii. Chris Ingrao – Seattle, WA, US – LUMEDIC
- b. Mission and scope of this WG (Tom—10 min)
- c. Real-world example of a full-stack GF (John Jordan—5 min)
  - i. British Columbia government challenges include digital identity of individuals, corporations, legal entities, etc. Many times, when an online service is offered, the identity field is simply treated as a freeform text field, creating serious issues with misidentification, fraud, and others.
  - ii. BC may lay out a set of policies at the Layer 4 level to make it clear who the recognized authorities are, in BC and elsewhere, for issuing identities (like drivers licenses).
  - iii. At Level 3, BC could also recognize registries for verified person credentials, permits, licenses, etc.
  - iv. BC might also recognize software solutions for citizens at Levels 2 and 1.
- d. Discussion of potential initial work items (Scott—15 min)
  - i. Survey of existing governance framework models
    - 1. E.g., FATF, Pan-Canadian Trust Framework
  - ii. Classes of use cases and boundaries required for governance
    - 1. Levels of assurance that drive decisions along the stack. For example, government clearance may require high quantity and quality of sources, while employment confirmation may require less-strong assurance. Scott suggests:
      - a. Untrusted class – no governance at all, status quo for the internet
      - b. Internet Grade – a minimum standard of assurance with governance, a key missing piece
      - c. Asset Grade
      - d. Classified Grade
    - 2. Need to understand use cases that government bodies might be asking of organizations such as ours. FATF example: is the digital ID system authorized by the government for use in customer due diligence (CDD)?
  - iii. Architectural Model for ToIP governance frameworks
    - 1. Required, recommended, and optional components at each layer
    - 2. Templates at each layer
  - iv. ToIP stack and verifiable credentials risk model
    - 1. See Confluence page that Scott has set up: [Identity and Verifiable Credential Risks](#)
  - v. Contributions to ToIP glossary
- e. Logistics (Drummond—10 min)
- a. Mailing list: go to [lists.trustoverip.org](https://lists.trustoverip.org) if you need to be added
  - i. Wiki: [wiki.trustoverip.org](https://wiki.trustoverip.org). Need Linux Foundation account
  - ii. Github repo structure (repository of best practices): [github.com/trustoverip](https://github.com/trustoverip)
    - 1. See organizational proposal from Dan Gisolfi
- iii. Task Forces
  - 1. Lightweight collaboration mechanism. Can spin up at any time and last as long as necessary.
  - 2. Minimum requirement: a wiki page.
  - 3. Can also have mailing list, github, etc.
- iv. Chairs
  - 1. We elect our own. At least one, up to three (at least 2 recommended), can rotate.
  - 2. Volunteers? (Conveners volunteer; no additional volunteers on the call, but welcome over mailing list)
- v. Meeting schedule: discuss over mailing list, watch for possible poll
  - 1. Alternate US/EU and APAC? Or two calls?
  - 2. Weekly or biweekly?