

# 2023-11-16 GSWG Meeting Notes

## Meeting Date

16 Nov 2023 The GSWG meets bi-weekly on Thursdays at 11:00-12:00 PT / 18:00-19:00 UTC. Check the [ToIP Calendar](#) for meeting dates.

## Zoom Meeting Link / Recording

- [Recording](#)

## Attendees

- [Scott Perry](#)
- [Judith Fleenor](#)
- [John Phillips](#)
- [Ashley Rhéaume](#)
- [Keerthi Thomas](#)
- [Neil Thomson](#)
- [Carly Huitema](#)
- [Steven Milstein](#)

## Main Goal of this Meeting

TBD

## Agenda Items and Notes (including all relevant links)

Time	Agenda Item	Lead	Notes
5 min	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Start recording</li><li>• Welcome &amp; antitrust notice</li><li>• Introduction of new members</li><li>• Agenda review</li></ul>	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Antitrust Policy Notice:</b> <i>Attendees are reminded to adhere to the meeting agenda and not participate in activities prohibited under antitrust and competition laws. Only members of ToIP who have signed the necessary agreements are permitted to participate in this activity beyond an observer role.</i></li><li>• New Members:</li></ul>
5 mins	Review of action items from previous meeting	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ Previous request for participation in the interim review of the <a href="#">vLEI Ecosystem Governance Framework</a></li></ul>
5 mins	Announcements	TF Leads	News or events of interest to Governance Stack WG members: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• -</li></ul>
10 mins	Issuer Requirements Task Force Update	<a href="#">Scott Perry</a>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ Current state of <a href="#">Issuer Requirements document</a>.</li><li>▪ The 4-week review process is now open</li></ul>
15 mins	Third Generation ToIP Stack Diagram Discussion	<a href="#">John Phillips</a>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <a href="#">Third Generation ToIP Stack Diagram</a></li><li>• <a href="#">Ways in which we might represent the ToIP governance architecture</a></li></ul>
5 mins	Any other business		
5 mins	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Review decisions /action items</li><li>• Planning for next meeting</li></ul>	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ Results of <a href="#">Issuer Requirements document</a> review process</li></ul>

## Notes

## Scott's Issuer Requirements Task Force Update

During the Governance Stack Working Group (GSWG) meeting on November 16, 2023, Scott Perry provided an update on the Issuer Requirements Task Force. Here are the key points from his update:

- 1. Current State of the Document:** Scott discussed the current state of the Issuer Requirements document, which had been in development for several months by the task force.
- 2. Review Process:** He announced that a 4-week review process was now open for the document. This review period was an opportunity for members of the GSWG to provide comments, questions, and issues on the document.
- 3. Document Structure:** The document was structured to meet the format of the Governance Meta Model. It was designed to be a sub-document that would comply with the governance metamodel, helping people understand what is part of a governance framework from an issuer's standpoint.
- 4. Content Focus:** The focus of the document was on the requirements of an issuer for consideration in building a governance metamodel compliant governance framework. It included generally accepted topics used by issuers of X.509 certificates, with considerations for how they would apply to verifiable credentials and the associated emerging technology.
- 5. Feedback and Finalization:** Scott sought feedback on the document and suggestions on how to finalize it. He mentioned that the document could potentially be split into a specification, guide, and template based on the feedback received.
- 6. Glossary Entries:** Scott acknowledged that the document might lead to the establishment of new glossary entries in the ToIP Glossary document.
- 7. Action Items:** He emphasized the importance of reviewing the document in 'suggested mode' on Google Docs to allow for track changes and easier consolidation of feedback.
- 8. Next Steps:** The goal was to have all comments reviewed and cleared in time for the next meeting, which would be in four weeks. Depending on the review, the task force would decide whether to approve the document and in what form (specification, guide, or template).

Scott Perry's update indicated that the Issuer Requirements Task Force had made significant progress and was now seeking broader input to refine and finalize the document, ensuring it aligns with the governance metamodel and serves the needs of the ToIP community.

## Third Generation ToIP Stack Diagram Discussion

John Phillips led a discussion on the Third Generation ToIP Stack Diagram during the Governance Stack Working Group (GSWG) meeting on November 16, 2023. The focus of the discussion was on how to represent the ToIP governance architecture effectively.

Here are some key points from John Phillips' discussion:

- 1. Layered Model and Governance Graph:** John introduced the concept of a "governance graph," which is a complex network of governance relationships within a governed system, such as health, finance, or education. He also discussed the idea of representing the governance of Trust over IP (ToIP) as a layered model, allowing for the description of governance for existing ecosystems.
- 2. Governance Molecules:** John talked about the idea that each ToIP entity should declare certain governance-related aspects, such as who governs it, who it governs, the specific governance arrangements, and the jurisdiction in which it operates. These declarations form the "molecules" of governance.
- 3. Alignment with Technology Stack:** John emphasized the need to align the governance stack architecture with the ongoing developments in the technology stack working group. He mentioned that the representation of wallets and agents might need to be distributed across different layers of the stack, rather than being confined to a single layer.
- 4. Overlays Concept:** He introduced the concept of "overlays," which allows for a base structure of layers with additional details overlaid on top. This approach can help to address the complexity of representing all aspects in a single diagram and allows for a focus on specific elements like wallets, agents, and trust registries.
- 5. Business Ecosystem Considerations:** John highlighted the importance of considering the business ecosystem, including incentive models and commercial models, which are crucial for understanding why people engage in an ecosystem.
- 6. Operational Stack:** He discussed the idea of an operational stack, which is separate from governance and technology. The operational stack deals with the day-to-day management and running of a system, as opposed to the independent oversight provided by governance.
- 7. Multiple Perspectives:** John acknowledged that different stakeholders might have different perspectives and needs when looking at the governance architecture. Therefore, it's important to consider the target audience and provide ways for them to find their place in the picture.
- 8. Deadline for Consolidation:** John suggested setting a deadline to achieve a consolidated view of the governance architecture, with the aspiration to have a refined diagram ready by the end of the calendar year.

The discussion was part of an ongoing effort to refine and agree upon a representation of the governance architecture that aligns with the technology stack and is accessible to various stakeholders. The goal is to help people understand how to govern systems within a Trust over IP environment effectively.

### Comments & Contributions

In addition, John Phillips summarized the comments and contributions of Darrell O'Donnell, Savita Farooqui, and Jo Spencer as they worked towards developing a Third Generation ToIP Stack Diagram. Here's a summary of the key points from their contributions as discussed by John:

1. **Darrell O'Donnell:** Darrell presented a diagram that showed an "exploded view" of a wallet, illustrating how the different functions that a wallet provides could be distributed across different layers of the ToIP stack. This approach highlighted the complexity and interlayer relationships of wallet functionalities.

2. **Savita Farooqu:** Savita emphasized the importance of considering the business ecosystem, including incentive models and commercial models, which are crucial for understanding why people engage in an ecosystem. She also pointed out that business requirements and interests are typically more focused on the higher application level, while technology interests are more concentrated on the lower levels. Her representation included a diagonal scale to illustrate the varying degrees of business and technology focus across different layers.

3. **Jo Spencer:** Jo introduced the concept of an operational stack, which is separate from governance and technology. He suggested that operations management, which deals with the day-to-day running of a system, is distinct from the independent oversight provided by governance. Jo's perspective was informed by his experience with global bank payment schemes, and he highlighted the need to consider operational aspects when defining governance architecture.

John Phillips recognized that each contribution brought a unique and valid perspective to the discussion. He suggested that the group should aim to integrate these different views into a multi-dimensional representation that allows stakeholders to understand governance from various angles. The goal was to avoid a popularity contest among the ideas and instead work collaboratively to find a way forward that would be inclusive and helpful for understanding the governance architecture within the Trust over IP environment.

## Screenshots/Diagrams (numbered for reference in notes above)

#1 See document links

## Decisions

## Action Items

- ☐ Call for review of [Issuer Requirements document](#) within the next four weeks
- ☐ Complete the [Third Generation ToIP Stack Diagram](#) before end of year