

2022-10-31 TSWG Meeting Notes

Meeting Date

- 31 Oct 2022 The TSWG meets bi-weekly on Mondays at 08:00-09:00 PT / 15:00-16:00 UTC. See the [ToIP Calendar](#) for meeting times and logistics.

Zoom Meeting Recording

- https://zoom.us/rec/share/GiDic5kU9L6A6t_TPvKyvOEZ4p4vhbttPhHmFEtJd8rNhrGxfniyHUpH2_S_iiieJ.vzB5XXq3shkwyZFi

Attendees

- [Darrell O'Donnell](#)
- [Drummond Reed](#)
- [Daniel Bachenheimer](#)
- [Michael Palage](#)
- [Antti Kettunen](#)
- [Jacques Latour](#)
- [Sandy Aggarwal](#)
- [sankarshan](#)
- [Andor Kesselman](#)
- [Steve McCown](#)

Main Goals of this Meeting

Review of all current Task Forces and planning for Internet Identity Workshop sessions.

Agenda Items and Notes (including all relevant links)

Time	Agenda Item	Lead	Notes
3 min	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Start recording• Welcome & antitrust notice• Introduction of new members• Agenda review	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Antitrust Policy Notice: <i>Attendees are reminded to adhere to the meeting agenda and not participate in activities prohibited under antitrust and competition laws. Only members of ToIP who have signed the necessary agreements are permitted to participate in this activity beyond an observer role.</i>• New Members:
5 min	General announcements	All	<p>Updates from TSWG members of general interest to the group:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Daniel Bachenheimer shared that the Biometrics Institute had their main event in London last week. Dan and his Accenture associate Kotryna presented on digital identity. Dan said there was a lot of interest in ISO mDL and ICAO DTC (Digital Travel Credential).<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ Drummond asked about the status of ICAO DTC's status. Dan explained that the only international standard cross-border credential is the ICAO ePassport. The DTC is based on that standard, so it is the only internationally approved travel credential. However it is very rigid in terms of issuance, extensibility and verifiability.◦ Dan also explained that the ICAO DTC does not specify an issuance protocol.◦ It also allows only proximity-based presentation.◦ Michael Palage agreed with everything that Dan said about ICAO DTC. He said that AMVA is rolling out their trust registry for mDL later this year. Michael himself has a Florida driver's license now. Michael said that they do envision an online presentation of how Florida is looking at doing this.◦ Dan is worried about the "phone home" component of the way ISO mDL verification works — to be able to request additional information from the issuer about the subject — is scary from a privacy standpoint.◦ Dan did say that the ISO mDL/mDOC spec allows for selective disclosure if claims are pre-issued.• Jacques Latour is leading the Trust Registry WG at DIACC. They are working on a definition of a trust registry, and it would be ideal if that aligned with ToIP.• Michael Palage said that both he and Jacques are going to be participating in an ICANN meeting on alternative identifiers. They will be sharing about ToIP and GLEIF LEIs and vLEIs.• @Drummond TODO about Bermuda.

2 m in	Review of Action Items from the previous meeting	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Judith Fleenor to put the submission of a European Identity Conference presentation or panel proposal on the agenda for the next Communications Committee meeting. <input type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Judith Fleenor to work with Darrell O'Donnell and Elisa Trevino and the rest of the TSWG to define and put in place a process for how a Working Group or Task Force can transition from early-stage development using lightweight collaboration tools like Google docs to a formal and rigorous system-of-record based on GitHub and pull requests (PRs). <input type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Darrell O'Donnell to connect with Drummond Reed, Antti Kettunen and Judith Fleenor to discuss a plan for recruiting: a) additional co-chair(s), and b) vice-chairs for the Technology Stack Working Group. <input type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Darrell O'Donnell to prepare a summary of the charter of the Trust Registry TF 2.0 for discussion at this coming Thursday's Technology Architecture TF meetings. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Drummond Reed to prepare a summary slide on the CLA process for Judith Fleenor to put into the presentation deck for this coming Wednesday's All-Member Meeting. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Drummond Reed to put IIW session planning on the agenda for the next meeting.
1 5 m in	Task Force Reports	TF Leads	<p>Technology Architecture TF — Wenjing Chu Drummond Reed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We are moving into the final stages of preparing the First Public Review Draft of the ToIP Technology Architecture Specification. • Drummond Reed is back from his next set of travels and will be focusing intensely this week on PRs that will address all the priority: high and priority: medium GitHub issues. <p>Trust Registry TF — Darrell O'Donnell</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Drummond explained that Darrell was traveling this week and could not attend to give an update, but that Darrell wants to start work on this in earnest after Internet Identity Workshop. • Jacques Latour met with the Franhauser team working on TRAIN, which is DNS-based, and wants to explore how that can be accommodated in V2. <p>ACTION: Drummond Reed to put the Trust Registry TF charter update on the agenda for the next TRTF meeting (post IIW), and let Jacques Latour know what that date is.</p> <p>ACDC TF — Samuel Smith Phil Fearheller</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>No one from ACDC was able to attend.</i> <p>AI & Metaverse (AIM) Technology TF — Wenjing Chu Vikas Malhotra</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sandy Aggarwal said that he was part of the last meeting, where they discussed doing a POC on personas and how they would register with one or more trust registries. Each of them could tie back to a specific real-world person, but some of the avatars may actually be AI bots of some kind. So the question is how they can be registered for purposes of authenticating and establishing trust. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ Sandy gave an example of Second Life, where two people are interacting, and they form a Second Life family that starts having "offspring" that do not actually tie back to any actual person. The "children" are just a process that is getting spun up. ◦ This closely ties back to some questions about the OpenWallet Foundation and responsibility for payments from a digital wallet. What do you do about an avatar-to-avatar payments? How do you handle receipts and accounting? ◦ Daniel Bachenheimer said that, at the biometrics meeting he mentioned (see Announcements above), there was a presentation by Meta about this same question about accountability. Dan was not very satisfied with the answers provided there. ◦ Sandy said that is why he is doing his research about how this aspect of payments needs to work. Do all actors in a payment system need to be registered with a trust registry of some kind, but at the same time enable anonymous "cash" transactions? ◦ Jacques Latour noted: "a persona would not register with a trust registry, the issuer would be registered in the trust registry... A persona would be registered in an issuer registry..." <p>W3C Concept Development TF (W3TF) — Darrell O'Donnell</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Still in formation.</i>
1 0 m in	OpenWallet Foundation discussion	Drummond Reed	<p>OWF is starting to coalesce around proposals for specific code modules and associated WGs. Candidates include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Payment Tokenisation (EMV Payment Tokenisation Specification) • ISO mDL (ISO/IEC 18013-5:2021 - Mobile Driving Licence (mDL)) • W3C Verifiable Credentials (W3C Verifiable Credentials Data Model v1.1) • Anonymous Credentials (AnonCreds Specification v1.0 Draft) <p>ToIP members and the TSWG may want to consider the code modules and associated/joint WGs that would provide ToIP interoperability.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Drummond explained that he believes OWF will have Associate Memberships for other industry non-profits like ToIP, DIF, OIIF, OIX, etc. • Daniel Bachenheimer asked the question of how OWF will define how to organize the effort such that all the parties at the table will have the same view of a digital wallet.
1 5 m in	Internet Identity Workshop sessions	All	<p>What TSWG-related sessions do we want to propose at IIW in two weeks? Candidates:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction to the ToIP Technology Architecture Specification Public Review Draft 2. The ToIP Trust Spanning Protocol 3. The ToIP Trust Registry Protocol
5 m in	Any other business		

5 m in	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review decisions /action items • Planning for next meeting 	Chairs	<p>Our next meeting falls on the Monday before IIW when a number of us will be traveling. Should we cancel that meeting?</p> <p>ACTION: Drummond Reed will cancel the next meeting on Nov 14. Our next meeting will be November 28 and will include a report on highlights of Internet Identity Workshop.</p>
--------------	---	--------	---

Decisions

- ☐ None.

Action Items

- ☐ ACTION: [Drummond Reed](#) to put the Trust Registry TF charter update on the agenda for the next TRTF meeting (post IIW), and let [Jacques Latour](#) know what that date is.
- ☐ ACTION: [Drummond Reed](#) will cancel the next meeting on Nov 14. Our next meeting will be November 28 and will include a report on highlights of Internet Identity Workshop.