

# 2021-09-16 TRTF Meeting Notes

## Meeting Date

- 16 Sept 2021

## Zoom Meeting Link / Recording

- <https://zoom.us/j/91888476340?pwd=VmNISG9DWENWempsdGpQeEpXND>  
(This link will be replaced with a link to the recording of the meeting as soon as that is available)

## Attendees

- [Drummond Reed](#)
- [Darrell O'Donnell](#)
- [Jim St.Clair](#)
- [Antti Kettunen](#)
- [Eric Drury](#)
- [Daniel Bachenheimer](#)
- [sankarshan](#)

## Main Goal of this Meeting

Close on all remaining open issues in the [V1 ToIP Trust Registry Protocol Specification](#).

## Agenda Items and Notes (including all relevant links)

Time	Agenda Item	Lead	Notes
5 min	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Start recording</li><li>• Welcome &amp; antitrust notice</li><li>• Introduction of new members</li><li>• Agenda review</li></ul>	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Antitrust Policy Notice:</b> Attendees are reminded to adhere to the meeting agenda and not participate in activities prohibited under antitrust and competition laws. Only members of ToIP who have signed the necessary agreements are permitted to participate in this activity beyond an observer role.</li><li>• New Members: None</li></ul>
5 min	Review of previous action items	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li><input type="checkbox"/> ACTION: <a href="#">Darrell O'Donnell</a> to propose a textual description of the data model that refers to Appendix A for the normative requirements.</li><li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Drummond Reed to add to the Design Requirements section a reference to the ToIP Governance Metamodel and its Information Trust related sections.</li><li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Drummond Reed to move any remaining non-requirements left in the Design Requirements section to another Google doc.</li><li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Drummond Reed and Darrell O'Donnell to propose a ToIP-domain based URI for identifying TR endpoints</li><li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Drummond Reed edit to specify that the serviceEndpoint value MUST be a single URI.</li><li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Darrell O'Donnell and Drummond Reed to think through a recommendation about EGF identifiers and TR identifiers, i.e., do we need both, and if so, should we return both?</li><li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION: Drummond Reed to make a proposal for terminology for this specification based on the work of the Concepts and Terminology WG.</li></ul>

30 mins	Review all remaining open issues	All	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Spec name:</b> should it be <b>ToIP Trust Registry Protocol V1</b> or <b>ToIP Peer Trust Registry Protocol V1</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ <b>DECISION: We will stick with the name "ToIP Trust Registry Protocol".</b></li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Authors:</b> Who else wants to be/must be listed? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ ACTION: <a href="#">Drummond Reed</a> to list all the contributors.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Design Requirements:</b> do we need this section any more? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ This section was removed as now it is redundant.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Governing Authorities:</b> Review <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ ACTION: <a href="#">Drummond Reed</a> to add text clarifying a one-to-many relationship between a GA and an authorized TR.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Trust Registry Service Property:</b> New <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ ACTION: <a href="#">Drummond Reed</a> to change the arity of service endpoint HTTPS URIs to one.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Trust Registry Protocol:</b> Review <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ ACTION: <a href="#">Darrell O'Donnell</a> to propose the query parameter encoding.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Data Model:</b> <a href="#">Darrell O'Donnell</a> done? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ See carryover action item.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Appendix A:</b> <a href="#">Darrell O'Donnell</a> done? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ ACTION: <a href="#">Darrell O'Donnell</a> to move the REST API structured URI vs. unordered parameters discussion over to Slack.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>OPTIONS:</p> <p>Shift from URL Parameter approach:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Issuer Query - Is Issuer authorized to issue CredentialType, under a particular EGF? <a href="https://domain.name/mainpath/issuer?EGFURI={EGFURI}&amp;Type={Type}&amp;IssuerURI={IssuerURI}">https://domain.name/mainpath/issuer?EGFURI={EGFURI}&amp;Type={Type}&amp;IssuerURI={IssuerURI}</a></li> <li>• Verifier Query - Is Verifier authorized to request PresentationType, under a particular EGF?</li> </ul> <p>To a URL Path approach:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <a href="https://domain.name/mainpath/issuer/{EGFURI}/{Type}/{IssuerURI}">https://domain.name/mainpath/issuer/{EGFURI}/{Type}/{IssuerURI}</a></li> <li>• <a href="https://domain.name/mainpath/verifier/{EGFURI}/{Type}/{VerifierURI}">https://domain.name/mainpath/verifier/{EGFURI}/{Type}/{VerifierURI}</a></li> <li>• <a href="https://domain.name/mainpath/trustregistry/{EGFURI}/{Type}/{OtherEGFURI}">https://domain.name/mainpath/trustregistry/{EGFURI}/{Type}/{OtherEGFURI}</a></li> <li>• <a href="#">Antti Kettunen</a> suggested the path could include EGF URI and then the others could be query parameters.</li> </ul>
10 mins	Glossary task	<a href="#">Drummond Reed</a>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ACTION: <a href="#">Drummond Reed</a> to propose on Slack the next steps for the glossary using a <a href="#">terms wiki</a> once the tool is ready in the Concepts and Terminology WG.</li> </ul>
5 mins	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review decisions /action items</li> <li>• Planning for next meeting</li> </ul>	Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>DECISION: As soon as the remaining action items are done, we are ready to go to Community Review.</b></li> <li>• <b>DECISION: We will move to a monthly meeting schedule.</b></li> <li>• ACTION: <a href="#">Darrell O'Donnell</a> to either change the ToIP Calendar entry (or request Elisa to do it).</li> </ul>

## Decisions

- **DECISION: We will stick with the name "ToIP Trust Registry Protocol".**
- **DECISION: As soon as the remaining action items are done, we are ready to go to Community Review.**
- **DECISION: The TRTF will move to a monthly meeting schedule.**

## Action Items

- ☐ ACTION: [Darrell O'Donnell](#) to propose a textual description of the data model that refers to Appendix A for the normative requirements.
- ☒ ACTION: [Drummond Reed](#) to list all the contributors.
- ☒ ACTION: [Drummond Reed](#) to add text clarifying a one-to-many relationship between a GA and an authorized TR.
- ☒ ACTION: [Drummond Reed](#) to change the arity of service endpoint HTTPS URIs to one.
- ☐ ACTION: [Darrell O'Donnell](#) to propose the query parameter encoding.
- ☒ ACTION: [Darrell O'Donnell](#) to move the REST API structured URI vs. unordered parameters discussion over to Slack.
- ☒ ACTION: [Drummond Reed](#) to propose on Slack the next steps for the glossary using a [terms wiki](#) once the tool is ready in the Concepts and Terminology WG.
- ☐ ACTION: [Darrell O'Donnell](#) to either change the ToIP Calendar entry (or request Elisa to do it).